Interactive comment on “Generating a global gridded tillage dataset” by Vera Porwollik et al.

Vera Porwollik et al.
vera.porwollik@pik-potsdam.de

Received and published: 18 March 2019

Thank you very much for providing helpful feedback. Please find below a point by point response to your comments.

Referee #6: This paper does not adhere to a single unit to describe area. The abstract and discussion use “MkmÈ2” while all figures and tables use “ha”. Readers cannot compare the different units directly and need to convert “ha” to “MkmÈ2”. Thus, I recommend that the authors use “kmÈ2” instead of “ha” in all the figures and tables. The main document should be also modified accordingly.

Authors’ response: We agree and will harmonize all area unit indication in the manuscript to km².

Referee #6: I tried to run R script on my PC; however it did not run because it required some data to run in my environment. Thus, I recommend that sample R script should be provided with sample input dataset and output dataset. Then reader can run R script with the data provided and verify their output against a sample output dataset that can be involved. Otherwise, the reader cannot check whether their results were correctly reproduced or not.

Authors’ response: It is correct that in order to run the script the user needs to download the input data sets as indicated in our article, R-code but also described in the metadata at the repository’s websites. We will include sample input and output datasets which can be applied for testing the functionality of the R-script.

Referee #6: In terms of figure 1, I suppose that each box in the figure should correspond to the R script. Thus, it is better to add information (ex. line number) that indicates which part of the R script corresponds to the boxes, and also to show the location in the Rscript, where different crop-specific tillage systems are evaluated. According to these, readers can easily understand the R script, which is also the authors’ objective.

Authors’ response: Thank you for this suggestion. We have now harmonized the wording of the tillage systems between the manuscript, the data-flow diagram (Figure 1) and the accompanying R-script. We improved the structure of the R-script to be more in line with the steps described in the manuscript. In the R-script we also added comments, indicating which section generates which table and values of the manuscript.